

Symposium on Art and Terrorism



10.00 – 18.00, Saturday 27 February 2016 (Registration from 09.30)

Kenneth Clark Lecture Theatre, The Courtauld Institute of Art, Somerset House, Strand, London WC2R 0RN #ArtandTerrorism



Palmyra destruction

Bringing together scholars of the image, art and violence with experts on counter-terrorism and conflict antiquities, the Courtauld Institute of Art and the Association for Research into Crimes against Art (ARCA) present a day-long symposium on the subject of Art and Terrorism. The collaborative event aims to provide a forum for engaging issues of urgent and wider public concern. Two strands of inquiry inform our discussion. One concerns histories and theories of war and images, including terrorist use of visual images and media, such as YouTube videos and the documented destruction of cultural monuments. The other takes a criminological approach, examining the use and abuse of art and antiquities by terrorist groups, including ISIS, al-Qaeda, the Taliban and the IRA. The event inaugurates a new initiative - Courtauld Debates – to bring the significance of art history to a wider audience, through public-facing dialogue. It also highlights a new collection of essays, *Art Crime: Terrorists, Tomb Raiders, Forgers and Thieves* (Palgrave), which features numerous expert speakers on this important and timely subject. (Contact: anna.kim@courtauld.ac.uk)

Organised by Professor Julian Stallabrass and Dr Anna Marazuela Kim (The Courtauld Institute of Art), Dr Noah Charney and Lynda Albertson (ARCA, Association for Research into Crimes against Art)

Ticket/entry details: £16 general admission (£11 students, Courtauld students/staff and concessions)

BOOK ONLINE: <http://www.eventbrite.co.uk/e/symposium-on-art-and-terrorism-tickets-20013135828>

"The Quake" الزلزال Directed by Matteo Barzini



PROGRAMME ABSTRACTS

09.30 – 10.00 Registration

10.00 – 10.15 Welcome – Alixe Bovey (The Courtauld Institute of Art)

Session I

Chair: Julian Stallabrass (The Courtauld Institute of Art)

10.15 – 10.30 Noah Charney (Founder, ARCA): Saving Antiquities from Terrorists.

For the thousands of ancient masterpieces destroyed, most famously the Bamiyan Buddhas, hundreds of even more important works have been saved, thanks to the heroic, courageous cunning of local Islamic curators. My talk will look at three examples of local curators, passionately in love with the objects in their charge, who risked their lives to preserve as much as they could from destruction. In each instance, from Iraq to Afghanistan to Mali, curators risked everything to hide the most important artefacts from their collection. Their technique was to swap in less-important objects that looked the part (or modern replicas, in order to preserve the most valuable objects in the collections).

10.30 – 11.00 Jennifer Good (Senior Lecturer in History and Theory of Documentary Photography, London College of Communication): The blinding cross: Totalising narratives of 9/11.

Like many violent events, 9/11 and its photographic representation seem to have prompted contradictory impulses: to look and to look away. This talk considers framing narratives put forward in the aftermath (largely via photography), which have rationalized the attacks according to a redemptive religious interpretation, while at the same time betraying a darker counter-narrative that can best be understood by means of the Freudian uncanny.

11.00 – 11.30 Anna Marazuela Kim (Andrew W. Mellon Post-Doctoral Fellow, The Courtauld Institute of Art): The New Image Wars.

Charting a genealogy of image and terrorism from 9/11 to Bamiyan, Hebdo, Mosul and Palmyra, my talk offers a series of reflections and provocations on the images wars of the present, from the *longue durée* of the interrelation of iconoclasm and critique. Drawing together art historical, historiographical, philosophical and anthropological perspectives, I offer conceptual frames to bridge academic and public discourse on the current crisis, as strategies for grappling with and resisting not only the destruction of culture, but also to comprehend deeper, less visible connections between images, persons, power and civilisation.

11:30 – 12.00 Francesco Rutelli (Former Italian Minister of Culture and Mayor of Rome, Chairman Associazione Incontro di Civiltà, President Cultural Heritage Rescue Prize): The Return of Iconoclasm: Ideology and Destruction by ISIS as a Challenge for Modern Culture

After World War II, the International Community decided that destruction of cultural heritage would be a crime, even in war, and not just "collateral damages". From the Den Haag Convention (1954) and all the UNESCO Conventions protecting heritage (as a resource for humankind, not just a "State affair"), we built a remarkable set of juridical principles and legal instruments. But Daesh-ISIS's decision to intentionally destroy cultural and religious diversity in our era has dramatically changed the game. What is happening? How can we achieve concrete results in order to avoid the diffusion of a new/old international season of iconoclasm?

12.00 – 13.00 *Lunch* (provided for the speakers/chairs only)

Session II

Chair: Noah Charney (ARCA)

13.00 – 13.30 Mike Giglio (Investigative Journalist and War Correspondent): Antiquities Looting and Terrorism: a View from the Field.

My talk will focus on how desperation drives the antiquities trade in Syria, from the looting to the initial marketing and selling. ISIS and other groups have capitalized on this desperation, and as long as it persists, so will the trade in stolen artifacts. I'll also discuss the chain of custody of objects, from these initial diggers and sellers, to buyers higher up the food chain — as well as how objects make the transition from the black market to the gray market. And I'll discuss some of the different objects I viewed and tracked personally, as well as some of the diggers, smugglers and sellers I met and their tactics and motivations. If it's possible on stage, I'd like to show photos of some of these objects during my talk.

13.30 – 14.00 Michael Will (Manager, Europol's Organized Crime Networks Group): Europol and European Involvement in the Fight Against Cultural Goods Trafficking.

My talk will introduce Europol, particularly FP Furtum - our involvement in the fight against CultCrime, on strategic and operational level. I will explain how Europol can support Law Enforcement Agencies and what overlaps we see between OC and terrorism with CultCrime. I will also point out why an improved information exchange is crucial in this effort.

14.00 – 14.30 Sam Hardy (Honorary Research Associate, UCL Institute of Archaeology): 'Blood clings to these things': Uncovering the trade in conflict antiquities.

The illicit trade in antiquities has constituted a revenue stream for repressive regimes and politically motivated armed groups since the 19thC yet even that exceptionally harmful trade in conflict antiquities remains understudied. And while early state crimes were sometimes documented with 'refreshing honesty, lack of cadre, and lack of hypocrisy' in the kinds of writings that Rob Newman has characterised as 'gung-ho military history full of stirring tales' of empire, contemporary state (and non-state) crimes are increasingly professionally denied and disguised and propagandised. So, they are increasingly difficult to expose and examine. However, online publication – including online archiving of historic texts – makes it increasingly possible to check and challenge official narratives. My talk will show the potential for open data analysis and the evidence for conflict antiquities trading under and beyond the media spotlight.

14.30 – 14.45 Film screening: "The Quake" الزلزال Directed by Matteo Barzini
Musical score by Ennio Morricone, Produced by Feel Film Production

14.45 – 15.30 Discussion

15.30 – 16.00 *Tea/coffee break* (Proceed to seminar rooms 1 & 2)

Session III

Chair: Anna Marazuela Kim (The Courtauld Institute of Art)

16.00 – 16.30 Julian Stallabrass (Professor of Modern and Contemporary Art, The Courtauld Institute of Art): Representing the Iraqi Resistance.

The definition of those who opposed the US invasion and occupation of Iraq was heavily contested. Were they terrorists or a resistance movement? Were they remnants of the old regime, foreign insurgents or a new Iraqi force? Representing them photographically was a risky business, and could lead to being targeted by US forces or accused of collaboration. Through a comparison of independent photojournalism, embedded photojournalism and the images used by the resistance themselves, this paper will explore political and representational limits in the civic medium of photography.

16.30 – 17.00 Edmund Clark (Photographer) Negative Publicity: Artefacts of Extraordinary Rendition

This talk will outline my work, with counterterrorism investigator Crofton Black, in assembling photographs and documents that confront the nature of contemporary warfare and the invisible mechanisms of state control. From George W. Bush's 2001 declaration of the 'war on terror,' until 2008,

an unknown number of people disappeared into a network of secret prisons organized by the US Central Intelligence Agency – transfers without legal process, otherwise known as extraordinary rendition. No public record was kept as these prisoners were shuttled all over the globe. Some were eventually sent to Guantánamo Bay or released, while others remain unaccounted for. Black and I Clark traveled worldwide to photograph former detention sites, detainees' homes, and government locations. We recreated the network that links CIA 'black sites,' and evoke ideas of opacity, surface, and testimony in relation to this process: a system hidden in plain sight.

17.00 – 17.30 Neville Bolt (Senior Teaching Fellow, Department of War Studies, King's College, London): Iconic Photographs & Geopolitics.

Millions of images circulate each day in the global media space that connects social media to more traditional outlets like television and the press. Occasionally some acquire iconic status linking the local event to higher moral, perhaps universal sensitivities. Particular images have come to represent the way terror events are understood in the popular imagination. But are they not misleading? Do other, less performative images not point to a more subtle subversion? These reach into the very heart of geopolitics and threaten the liberal conscience.

17.30 – 17.45 Giovanni Boccardi (Chief of the Emergency Preparedness and Response Unit of UNESCO's Culture Sector): UNESCO's Global Action to Protect Cultural heritage Under Threat.

A rapidly evolving global scenario and the continuous and increasingly violent manifestations of cultural cleansing, especially in the Middle East and North Africa, that include not only deliberate attacks against cultural heritage and widespread looting, but also persecutions against minorities and the expressions of their cultural identity, have highlighted the close link between culture, security and human rights. This situation is questioning many of the assumptions on which UNESCO, the only UN Agency with a mandate for the protection of culture, was operating. The Organization needs therefore to reassess its strategies and approaches. This is being done not only to protecting culture for its own sake, but also to ensure that culture's potential for building resilience and social cohesion is harnessed in humanitarian and peace building efforts. Building on its wide range international legal standards, which need to be more streamlined and operationalized, UNESCO has recently adopted a Strategy and is in the process of engaging with new partners to deal with these unprecedented challenges. The strategy has two main objectives, which are: the strengthening of Member states abilities to prevent, mitigate and recover the loss of cultural heritage and diversity as a result of conflict; and the incorporation of the protection of culture into the scope of humanitarian action and security. This presentation will, thus, illustrate the scope of UNESCO's current actions to protect heritage under threat, the challenges faced and outline some areas of work to be explored through partnering with other International Organizations and stakeholders outside of the culture sector.

17.45 – 18.30 Plenary Discussion

18.30 *Reception*