

§ REALISMES SOUS LE SIGNE DU DRAPEAU ROUGE, 1945-1960.  
A la mémoire d'Annie Kriegel.

'Qu'est-ce que le réalisme socialiste? ...Peut-être n'est-ce qu'une vision d'intellectuel transi de peur, surgie des ténèbres fantastiques de la dictature stalinienne? ...On évalue la production du réalisme socialiste en milliards de feuilles imprimées, en kilomètres de toiles et de pellicules, en siècles d'heures...'

Andrei Siniavskii, Esprit, 1959.<sup>i</sup>

Joseph Vassonarivitch Stalin has been presented as demiurge and creator of his own, empire-wide Gesamtkunstwerk.<sup>ii</sup> One may hold Hitler and the philosophy of nazism responsible for attempted genocide and the ruin of Europe by 1945, but Stalin, his survivor, to no small extent set the divided agendas of world politics and culture in the second half of the twentieth century, until Communism as a thought-system and regime also collapsed.

As the 1930s progressed, the Comintern's far-reaching penetration of cultural structures and its advocacy of realist styles throughout Europe, North America and Mexico, is now established, although its policing of the avant-garde has yet to be traced in detail.<sup>iii</sup> In the Soviet Union, a realist practice increasingly mirrored the ethos of 'fizkultura', intimately linking painting and sculpture to the military-industrial complex. The site for 'revolutionary' art shifted from the polis to the sportsground and ultimately to the battlefield, the line of action. The great military epics and panoramas, produced for the New York World's Fair and the All-Union Exhibition in Moscow in 1939, and powerful works such as Aleksandr Deineka's Defence of Sebastopol, 1942, marked a climax.<sup>iv</sup> Indeed, in Europe too, practices inherited from 1914-18 were readopted as a realist, dramatic art aspired to match the dimensions of the second World War.

The parallels between nazi and Soviet art in the 1930s are continually rehearsed; however non-avant-garde art after 1945 in the fields of war art, commissioned portraiture or 'militarised' landscape paintings have not been adduced comparatively in conjunction with Soviet Socialist Realism. How should one characterise the Montparnassian Foujita's La baie des perles, 8 décembre 1941, a realist painting based on aerial military photographs, or his L'attaque japonais sur l'aerodrome américain de Leyte ? Subsequently dubbed a 'criminal war painter' Foujita fled to America with a passport personally provided by General MacArthur....<sup>v</sup> Alternatively, what kind of realism is that of Jack Levine, a son of first generation Lithuanian Jewish immigrants in Boston, his inspirations Soutine, Beckmann, Kokoschka, his works purchased by the Museum of Modern Art, the Metropolitan museum, the Hirschhorn, despite his prewar militant association with Communist organisations such as the Artists' Congress and the John Reed Clubs? He himself defined American 'socialist realism', a movement which 'did not outlive the war' as running 'the gamut from the heroic to the ironic, from the satirical to the sensational, from the passionate to the cerebral, from cliché to fantasy, from naturalism to symbolism, covering a range of styles that included all the current modes just this side of non-objectivism'<sup>vi</sup> Like so many of his paintings, Election Night, 1954, - a gift from Joseph Hirschhorn to the Museum of Modern Art,

New York - is an allegory, with more than a touch of his expressionist European precursors, but a sense of flesh, jewels, a sensuality all his own. From the 1930s and into the period of Macarthyist America, when orthodox 'Communist' art was dangerous, persecuted, and mainly a question of graphics,<sup>vii</sup> Levine produced great oils on the theme of capitalism, politics and crime: Brechtian in scope, deeply American in complexion - visible neither on museum walls, nor in our textbooks.

The comparisons suggested by Christine Lindey in Art in the Cold War, between the images of Stalin and Frank O. Salisbury's Franklin D. Roosevelt, 1945, or Pietro Annigoni's H.M. Queen Elizabeth II, 1954, raise many questions extending beyond a revisionist post-1945 art history to the anthropological dimensions of cults of personality.<sup>viii</sup> Let one not forget that 40,000 Frenchmen visited the exhibition held in honour of Stalin's seventieth birthday in December 1949, prior to the departure of the birthday presents to the USSR in a special train and their subsequent exhibition in the evacuated Pushkin Museum - a tribute ranging from André Fougeron's Hommage à André Houiller, militant communiste abattu à l'âge de 54 ans alors qu'il procédait à l'affichage des tracts contre la guerre and Picasso's impudent drawing, A ta santé, Staline, to children's drawings and knitted socks...<sup>ix</sup>

Europe in 1945, ruthlessly divided by the Allied Powers, was poised at a crucial moment of change. The great destruction implied punishment, despair and yet the possibility of reconstruction, a new beginning, 'die Stunde Null' or zero hour, as it was called in Germany. In both East and West, 1945 marked the beginning of a period of mourning for a civilisation shattered; unimaginable millions of dead; a mourning universally expressed in figurative art, from Boris Taslitzky's Le Petit Camp de Buchenwald, 1945 (purchased by the Musée National d'Art Moderne) to the countless images of ruined Dresden, and later, the East German memorials: Fritz Cremer's at Buchenwald and Mauthausen, Will Lammert's at Ravensbruck, Waldemar Grzimek's group at Sachsenhausen.<sup>x</sup> There were depictions of victims, depictions of survivors. Significantly before the creation of the Cominform in 1947, militant artistic regroupings took place in both East and West; hence in France the Union des Arts Plastiques was born out of the resistant Front National des Arts, involving survivors of the prewar Association des Ecrivains et des Artistes Révolutionnaires: Boris Taslitzky, and Edouard Pignon and André Fougeron (who spearheaded, under Picasso's aegis, a short-lived epuration policy in the fine arts). In East Germany the same went for the Asso artists, acronym of the ARBKD (Association Revolutionären Bildender Kunst Deutschlands), the art organisation of the KPD (Kommunistisches Partei Deutschlands). In both East and West there were of course the fellow-travellers. As in France, the first major exhibitions after the war in East Germany were remarkably pluralistic, even in the Soviet-occupied zone. The Allgemeine Deutsche Kunstausstellung in Dresden, organised in 1946 by Will Grohmann with the former Asso artist, Hans Grundig, was the first inventory of inner and outer emigration; it involved styles as varied as expressionism, Bauhaus, Neue Sachlichkeit and that of the

Asso-Kunstler themselves, and formats such as the altarpiece, recalling the use of this traditional format by 'degenerate' artists such as Kirchner and Otto Dix. An article in Neues Deutschlands, on October 4th, 1946, called for a 'levelling' of styles. In October 1947 Max Grabowski, no doubt responding to Soviet orders, condemned Neue Sachlichkeit, Futurism, Cubism, Expressionism and Surrealism, heralding an era of realist conformism.<sup>xi</sup> It is striking that the phases of reconstruction and consolidation and their relationship to socialist realist painting, sculpture and architecture followed rhythms in the East often quite distinct from those in the West, particularly after Stalin's death.<sup>xii</sup> General themes such as building workers against scaffolding (taken up later in the West with Fernand Léger's Constructeurs series of 1951) rapidly became clichés, varying tremendously in quality. The system of doublethink in the East was analysed in Czeslaw Milosz's The Captive Mind, published in the West in 1953. He spoke of 'universal masquerade', the cult of ugliness and the destruction of all experiment in art. Paradoxically, however, both in the Soviet Union and in the Eastern Bloc, the masses were often able to find a certain beauty in their art and a genuine spirit of celebration in their cultural festivals (compare the euphoric fêtes of L'Humanité and L'Unita).<sup>xiii</sup>

1947 marked the high point of crisis and division. The U.S.S.R., utopian 'other place' and seat of cultural authority for all other Communist parties, experienced a period of consolidation and slow sclerosis. It was left to cultural experts to ratify directives. Firstly to Aleksandr Guerassimov, President of the new USSR Academy of Arts, 'the executive arm of the Party in the art world'; his collected articles from 1948-1951, textual equivalents of the cult of personality, appeared in the USSR as For Socialist Realism, 1952. Secondly to Andrei Zhdanov, who from 1946, as mouthpiece of Stalin's deliberate chauvinistic and 'anti-cosmopolitan' (pointedly anti-semitic) policies, had inaugurated the period of the persecution of Soviet intellectuals, the 'zhdanovschina'.<sup>xiv</sup> In fact in Moscow itself (not to elaborate upon the regional variations across the vast republics<sup>xv</sup>), socialist realism as an art form with its own vigour, dynamism, even charm at times, was undergoing stagnation. Despite some substantial architectural projects in the occasionally splendid Stalinist style, such as Moscow State University (1948-53) or the odd 'masterpiece' such as Fedor Shurpin's The Morning of our Motherland, 1948,<sup>xvi</sup> there were Guerassimov's increasingly stiff cult-of-personality paintings (I.V.Stalin by A.A.Zhdanov's coffin, 1948), or the welter of tedious Soviet shock-brigade pictures, promoted at his peril by Louis Aragon in France in 1952.<sup>xvii</sup> In all, this was the period when the artist became 'the blind executor of tasks sent down from on high'.<sup>xviii</sup> One may juxtapose the artist's predicament with the allegorical content of his paintings according to Wolfgang Holz's semiotic analysis: allegory as a strategy for coping with loss in a period of actual decline - the very antithesis of how the USSR attempted to represent itself internally and externally, both in satellite countries and to the Communist Parties of the West.<sup>xix</sup> The greater masters showed a tailing off - compare the brilliant formal constructions of the Deineka from the 1920s to the Great Patriotic War, and his glum

Panorama of Housing Construction near Moscow, 1949, with its virtuous women protagonists.

Zhdanov, responsible for the formulation of Soviet socialist realism in 1934, became the spokesperson at the first Comintern conference of the 'two camp' theory, one 'imperialist and anti-democratic', the other 'anti-imperialist and democratic' which quickly extended to the arts.<sup>xx</sup> Matisse and Picasso were denounced in August, 1947 in the Pravda by Guerassimov, an attack reported widely in French press: 'Il n'est pas concevable qu'à un niveau identique de développement, l'art soviétique puisse sympathiser avec l'art bourgeois décadent représenté par ces professeurs de pensée formaliste que sont les Français Matisse et Picasso ...'<sup>xxi</sup> Can one coordinate the subsequent cultural edicts in France, Italy and beyond? Stalin had dissolved the Comintern precisely to facilitate his role as major ally in the drawing-board division of Europe at Yalta. In response to the 1947 declaration of the Truman Doctrine and the Marshall Plan for the military and economic reconstruction of Western Europe by the U.S.A., he set up the Cominform as an organ of coordination for the response of the satellite Communist countries. The U.S.A. package had persuasive cultural dimensions, as Comrade Suzlov reported to his Cominform bosses in 1949: 'Ever newer means are being sought for manipulating public opinion, doping the masses with a frenzied propaganda of racist, anti-human hateful ideas, kindling an atomic psychosis and war hysteria. All media of psychological influence are being brought into play, the press, literature, radio, cinema the church... One important method used to work on the countries being 'Americanised' is to feed them with American detective stories and Hollywood films in which gangsters and murderers, sadists and seducers, hypocrites and humbugs invariably appear as the principal heroes. This sort of 'art' and 'literature' poisons and stupefies the reader and spectator.' The Cominform papers reveal an overriding obsession with the Marshall Plan, the Yugoslavian 'betrayal', and cultural strategies. Yet while an exhibition of Soviet painting in Hungary was visited by 216,000 people - an 'extraordinary new interest' according to Comrade Rakovski in 1949 - surprisingly, the term 'socialist realism' does not occur in the minutes of these Cominform sessions.<sup>xxii</sup> The accent, instead was on 'peace', the creation of the Mouvement de la Paix, with the official multi-language organ Pour une Paix Durable, pour une Démocratie Populaire; poster campaigns, art exhibitions and the collection of signatures, such as the Stockholm appeal against the atomic bomb and nuclear proliferation (of its 600 million signatures - the entire Eastern bloc's vote was coopted - officially 14 million were French)<sup>xxiii</sup>.

Whatever archival coordinations remain to be made, arts policies were constantly being expanded and updated. 'Le Kominform donne les lignes directives de la stratégie, de l'activité, de la réflexion et de la propagande des partis communistes jusqu'à sa dissolution, le 17 avril, 1956. Il contrôle leur activité et exerce une pression permanente...'<sup>xxiv</sup>

The problem of indigenous cultural heritage (raised by Lenin in What is to be done?, 1902), while notionally suppressed through a dreary homogenisation in the Eastern bloc, raised far greater problems in the West. Within a capitalist, consumerist economy flourished the extensive

`contre-société' as defined by Annie Kriegel: `Un parti communiste occidental, c'est un parti qui n'est pas au pouvoir, qui opère dans un société industrielle dotée de tous les signes de la modernité (science, technologie, classe ouvrière, social-démocratie, empire colonial) qui a promis de recevoir en héritage tout ce qui concourt à l'identité européenne.<sup>xxxv</sup> Life, cultural expectations and art itself were in no way comparable with Eastern European and Soviet experiences: socialist realism in painting confronted and coexisted with abstract or post-cubist avant-gardes. Moreover, each country had its political focuses such as Thorez or Togliatti, while the major aestheticians such as Brecht or Lukacs (see The Meaning of Contemporary Realism, 1957), almost never wrote on the fine arts. Thus legitimation via national realist traditions - despite their anachronism - was promoted variously in Communist periodicals such as Arts de France or Realismo.<sup>xxvi</sup>

In France, Laurent Casanova, cultural spokesman, at the eleventh P.C.F. Congress in 1947 defined what the Party deemed an `avant-garde' art: `D'abord, la volonté d'aider à la prise de conscience du peuple et le désir de l'aider à atteindre les buts qu'il se propose. C'est à dire, l'effort pratique avec le peuple. Ensuite, l'honnêteté dans la recherche des valeurs culturelles, propres à notre temps et à notre pays. C'est à dire la démarche objective de pensée.- Enfin, l'esprit de responsabilité personnelle devant le peuple.<sup>xxvii</sup> The results in France were visible by the time of the Salon d'Automne, which was officially visited by Maurice Thorez, photographed for l'Humanité in front of a painting... by Matisse. Not only did a socialist realist practice have to evolve, so, concurrently did a new art history. With only Beskin on Formalism (1933) and a little Plekhanov, Louis Aragon, the painter André Fougeron himself and other influential writers returned to realist national traditions from the revolutionary David, to Courbet and to Daumier; from Poussin to Picasso as painters of the `Massacre of the Innocents'.<sup>xxviii</sup>

Both the hagiographical and the eschatological element in these enterprises was crucial. Beyond the horror or compassion evoked by suffering subjects, the dead spoke to the living: an ancestry, a `filiation' was established, simultaneously bestowing cultural respectability upon the Party, from Fougeron's Davidian dead miners in the vast travelling show `Le Pays des Mines' 1951, to Edouard Pignon's loosely-handled Ouvrier Mort of 1953, even death as palimpsest - the dead Marat - evoked in Léger's otherwise jovial, flat and brightly-coloured Hommage à Louis David, Les Loisirs, 1948-9.<sup>xxix</sup> Boris Taslitzky's Mort de Danielle Casanova, 1950-1 was especially resonant: painted at a moment subsequent to the relaunching of the `main tendue' towards the Catholic vote, it deployed the tropes of Christian martyrdom to evoke extermination at Auschwitz, an homage not only to Danielle and her extensive cult, but his own Jewish mother who perished there. Moreover the painting was exhibited in the context of the P.C.F.'s propaganda war against the government's involvement with the Communauté Européenne de Défense: `Plus jamais ça'...<sup>xxx</sup>

An alternative, liberal humanist realism sheltered under the aegis of Picasso, whose Guernica and Massacre in Korea, in reproduction became catalysts for discussion on both sides

of the Iron Curtain. In France, Picasso's Le Charnier, exhibited at 'Art et Résistance' in 1946, first generated the uncomfortable debate on communism and style. 'La peinture de Picasso n'est pas l'esthétique du communisme. Celle de Tatzlitsky (sic) non plus... Le marxisme n'est pas une prison...' <sup>xxxix</sup> declared Roger Garaudy, prior to his sound refutation and the advocacy of realism by Louis Aragon. Picasso himself, who joined the P.C.F. on October 4th, 1944 would rapidly become the most famous Communist in the world after Stalin and Mao Tse Tung; he was pursued with astonishing inefficiency by the F.B.I. from December 19th 1944. 'Subject Pablo Picasso. File no. 100-337396' was set up even before the end of the war and Yalta. A heavily censored page in the 1950s described his 'Organizational Affiliations: Committee for Aid to the Spanish Republicans / Committee of French Intellectual Friends of Spain / French Committee for the "Defense of the Twelve" / French Communist Party / Joint Anti-Fascist Refugee Committee / Spanish Refugee Committee of the Joint Anti-Fascist Refugee Committee / Spanish Republicans in France / Union of Spanish Intellectuals / World Congress of Intellectuals for Peace / World Congress of Partisans for Peace.' <sup>xxxix</sup>

Picasso constituted the apex of an East-West triangle, and is at the centre of one of the most grotesque misunderstandings in the history of the postwar period. He was considered obnoxiously modernist in the USSR (Guerassimov was made to apologise for shaking his hand at the 1950 Peace Congress before the Soviet Academy) as he was by the panoply of like-minded senators and generals in the U.S.A. The unfortunate elision the latter made, however, was to deduce that all modern art was 'communistic'. Senator George Dondero's charge that 'so-called modern art contains all the "isms" of depravity, decadence and destruction', naming Picasso as 'one of the leaders of the art of "isms",' was reproduced from the Chicago Daily Sun-Times (17/8/49) in the F.B.I. file, marked, as always, 'SECRET'. In counterpoint, for the more enlightened cadres of the C.I.A. and the Museum of Modern Art, New York, Western European modernism was a bastion of liberty, of avant-gardism, of art as an autonomous practice to be funded and promoted against realism, the art of the Communists, from the spectre of a little-known Soviet practice to the expressionistic post-cubism of a Guttuso in Italy. <sup>xxxix</sup> In this already manichean light, one should compare the Peace conference exhibitions of 1948 and 1950 held under the Cominform aegis with the Venice Biennale shows of the same years.

Ruined Wroclaw was chosen as the venue of the Communist-originated International Peace Congress. <sup>xxxix</sup> Here, Picasso exhibited his Vallauris ceramic plates. Fernand Léger, Paul Eluard, Aimé Césaire, Ilya Ehrenbourg and Renato Guttuso from Italy also participated. An exhibition of contemporary French painting was opened at Wroclaw University. After visiting Cracow and Auschwitz and Picasso was decorated by Boleskaw Bierut for his 'contribution à l'oeuvre de collaboration culturelle internationale et pour ses efforts dans le domaine de l'amitié polono-française.' However, at the second World Peace Congress, banned by the Labour government and forced to move from Sheffield, Britain, to Warsaw at the end of 1950, the art

exhibitions were highly socialist-realist in content, reflecting changes since 1948 in museum and exhibition policies, the closing of the celebrated collection of abstract art and Lodz, and the imposition of a realism seen in seamless continuity with Polish nineteenth-century sources. At the National Museum of Warsaw, 'La Jeunesse combat pour la Paix' included 'de nombreuses toiles retraçant la lutte ardente du peuple polonais pour leur libération' - oeuvres collectives par les élèves de l'Ecole des Beaux-Arts de Varsovie'.

Alternatively, in 'Artistes Plasticiens pour la défense de la Paix', Wojciech Fangor's La paix invitant les dockers des pays impériaux à jeter à la mer les armes meurtrières, demonstrated French socialist realism used as an authoritative model: the anti-colonialist subject matter had been specified by Maurice Thorez at the XIIth Party congress at Genevilliers in April, 1950.<sup>xxxv</sup> Gérard Singer's 'Poussinesque' version of the rebel dockers, Le 10 février à Nice, was taken down by the police at the Salon d'Automne in Paris in 1951.<sup>xxxvi</sup> (How soon did this canvas make its own way to the Museum of Fine Art, Lodz?) Fangor's trajectory, passing through Paris at its socialist-realist apogee, moving to New York and adopting a Olitski-like colour-field abstraction, is one of many like parables of the later 20th century.<sup>xxxvii</sup>

Yet it was here in Warsaw that Picasso received the Lenin Peace Prize, not for his painting but for his dove poster, first deployed for the Salle Pleyel Paris-Prague conference of November 1949. Pablo Neruda's speech indicated the already international dimensions of the Peace-movement: the charismatic dove was imitated worldwide in both 'high' and popular culture (see Berni's Manifestacion, 1951): 'La colombe de Picasso survole le monde. Le Département d'État la menace de ses flèches empoisonnées, les fascistes de Grèce et de Yougoslavie de leurs mains rouges de sang. Sur le peuple héroïque de Corée, Mac Arthur, l'assassin, lance sur elle des bombes incendiaires au napalm. Les satrapes qui gouvernent la Colombie et le Chili voudraient lui interdire l'entrée de ces pays. En vain.'<sup>xxxviii</sup>

'Artistes Plasticiens pour la Défense de la Paix' in Warsaw also demonstrated the rapid dissemination of Chinese revolutionary themes. In May, 1942, at the Yen-an Forum on Literature and Art, using a melange of Chinese and Soviet writers, Mao had advocated an art for workers, peasants, soldiers and revolutionary cadres, that would denounce the cruelty and lies of Japanese imperialism and proclaimed two mots d'ordre: 'p'u-chi' - popularism and 't'i-kao', the raising of standards.<sup>xxxix</sup> When in 1949, the Chinese Communist Party came to power and socialist realism became official doctrine, party officials traced its lineage back to the 1930s native master Xu Biehong, as a legitimating move. From 1949 to 1959, China invited Soviet experts to teach in its academies and sent students and artists to the USSR. (The problem of combining the diktat of Socialist realism with indigenous traditions was again crucial; the lugubrious Soviet models impelled Mao in 1959, via his spokesman Xhou Yang to call for a Revolutionary realism and revolutionary romanticism to be interpreted as brighter colour and dynamic narrative action.<sup>xl</sup>) The Warsaw exhibition reflected this new dimension to socialist realism, with Z. Majewsky:

Portrait de Mao-Tse Tung, or L. Constanty: Ho Chi-Minh. By 1949 Maoist socialist realism was reproduced in the Communist periodical Arts de France and portraits of Ho-Chi Minh joined the Stalinist themes in De Marx à Staline, held in Paris in 1953.<sup>xli</sup>

In contrast, at the Venice Biennales, symbol of the renewal of Italy and its art structures, besides the plethora of new abstract work, artists such as Renato Guttuso (active during the Resistance and involved with realistic depiction of partisan heroism) along with many contemporaries, now exhibited large, dramatic canvases, explicitly Communist in theme, while certainly revealing a continuing debt to expressionist origins and above all Picasso in style.<sup>xlii</sup> Guttuso's work at the 1948 Biennale excited the British critics, Herbert Read and Douglas Cooper. He exhibited Occupazione delle terre in Sicilia, 1949, at the Venice Biennale of 1950, a painting for him full of the memory of his childhood, his family, the lamentations of the starving peasants that were his people, and their militant demonstrations in the years 1946-7. The Mexican Muralists, Orozco, Riviera Tamayo and Siqueros were also revealed to the European public at the Biennale that year, confirming its militant tone. In 1952, Guttuso showed the huge history painting, Battaglia al Ponte Ammiraglio, a symphony of battling bodies decked out with the sign of contemporary struggle, shirts of a brilliant red.<sup>xliii</sup> The American counter-strategies, now highly sophisticated, emphasised liberality and cultural 'freedom' by expressly exhibiting the left-wing realist Ben Shahn in conjunction with William de Kooning at the next Biennale show of 1954.<sup>xliv</sup>

Interestingly, in their own attempt to turn away from the 'bourgeois' School of Paris, the British movement of Communist painters and fellow-travellers, rediscovering the Ruskinian tradition of Italophilia after the war, adopted Guttuso as their mentor and inspiration, translating his writings, and exhibiting him in London. He was befriended by intellectuals such as Ernst Gombrich and Richard Wollheim. John Berger's monograph written after a stay with the artist was published in German only, in Dresden, in 1957.<sup>xlv</sup> While Guttuso remained a great national figure in a country with its own militant tradition and particular brand of 'Eurocommunism', this British excursion which involved the later manifestations of the Artists' International Association, Trades Union murals, a strange hybridisation with our own 'neo-romantics' such as John Minton, the 'Kitchen Sink' painters, Jack Smith, John Bratby, remains largely part of a 'Forgotten Fifties'.<sup>xlvi</sup>

Peter de Francia's canvas, The Bombing of Sakiet, 1958, contemporary with André Fougeron's Massacre de Sakiet Sidi Youssef, remains arguably the British masterpiece of the genre. The question of colonialism had previously been couched simply as anti-Americanism in the context of the 'sale guerre' exemplified by Picasso's Massacre en Corée, 1951 (with its references to Poussin, Degas, Manet its putative 'realism' was nonetheless a disappointment to hardliners). Now the question of French colonialism in Algeria presented the 'patriotic' P.C.F. with more complex problems. In the wake of Fougeron's immensely successful 'Le Pays des

Mines' exhibition, 1951, Boris Taslitzky and Mireille Mialhe's 'Algérie '52' opened at the Galerie André Weil, Paris, in January 1953. The poignant reportages by Boris Taslitzky in 'Face à l'histoire' can give no idea of the dimensions of the show: forty paintings and sixty drawings, including his huge historical panorama Femmes d'Oran, in which enraged Algerian dockers' wives lift their veils to attack the colonial police with huge boulders, of Mireille Mialhe's Jeunes Travailleurs Agricoles of 2 x 3 metres, nor an idea of the orchestration of vernissage, bussed-in visitors, polemics in both Parisian and Algerian pro- and anti-Communist press, and finally the tour of Eastern Europe, the ultimate destination for many of these canvases, now 'disappeared' as is their story. Mialhe's role as a woman painter, penetrating the female spaces of a veiled and sequestered Orient, her role as complement to Taslitzky is particularly interesting.<sup>xlvii</sup> Painters such as Geneviève Zondervan, Marie-Anne Lansiaux (accompanied by her photographer-husband Willy Ronis to so many demonstrations) should expand the socialist realist story; the militants, Annie Kriegel, Dominique Desanti, Hélène Parmelin, Nadia Léger, Elsa Triolet or at a higher political level Jeanette Vermeersch had a crucial role to play - to cite the French case alone. In contrast to the heroics, the overwhelming 'muscularity' of socialist realism (the rhetorics of virility for parties out of power) the fact of democracy and the female vote in the West had accounted for the cult of heroines: Picasso's much-reproduced drawing of Djamilia Boupacha in the Algerian context was but one of a myriad of drawings he made for the Communist press during the period.<sup>xlviii</sup> Above all the peace movement mobilised woman as wife and mother and mourner for the dead within the communist 'family': 'La colombe de Picasso survole le monde, très blanche et lumineuse, portant aux mères de douces paroles d'espoir et éveillant du battement de ses ailes les masses, pour leur rappeler qu'ils sont des hommes, des fils du peuple, et que nous ne voulons pas qu'ils aillent à la mort.'<sup>xlix</sup> The dove was so internationally successful that an F.B.I.-funded peace campaign was set up as a riposte: its most celebrated poster La colombe qui fait boum! Appropriating 'Pain, paix et liberté' as a slogan from its Communist rivals, the 'Paix et Liberté' movement, with its posters and propaganda campaign had its own bulletin, Défendre la vérité. Their statistics and accurate maps of Soviet labour camps (not to speak of the Pierre Daix / David Rousset libel trial sparked in 1949, or Rousset's Pour la vérité sur les camps concentrationnaires, 1951) compounded the symptom of 'denial' of broad swathes of the left in France.<sup>1</sup>

Within a context dominated by colonial carnage and the symbolic electrocution of the Soviet 'spies', Julius and Ethel Rosenberg, the dialectic between left and right, male and female, good and evil, joy and despair, new life and death rotates around the centre point of André Fougeron's Civilisation Atlantique, France's greatest history painting of the Cold War period, hidden from view since the Salon d'Automne of 1953 (and from which Les Nord Africains au portes de la ville, 1954, asleep under their corrugated iron derived) is now widely reproduced and discussed, already acquiring a legendary fame (see Pascal Quignard's novel, L'Occupation

Américaine, 1994). Its status approaches that of a still-concealed Krushchev report; a close reading reveals that its kaleidoscopic denunciations of Cold War culture rests upon a situation of multiple aporia. The victory of the proletarian revolution was now a hopeless cause; in the Communist 'contre-société' any ideas of a Soviet alternative in 1953-4, in Europe's period of consumerism and economic miracle was risible, while the equation modernisation = Americanisation was and still is for France, as is Fougeron's painting, frankly uncontestable.

Old hatreds could still simmer, and after Stalin's death in March 1953, many of the Cold War dynamics remained unchanged. The veteran surrealist leader André Breton, after finally challenging his old adversary Louis Aragon in 1952 - far too late, as was surrealism's response in general<sup>li</sup> - attacked the Mexican Muralist Siqueiros on the occasion of the exhibition of Mexican and pre-Columbian art at the Musée d'Art Moderne, Paris in May-June 1953. He accused Siqueiros in a leaflet of having hands 'stained with blood', a reference to his supposed role in the assassination of Trotsky, while Benjamin Peret devoted a page to Siqueiros in Arts-Spectacles as 'a painter who stains the Mexican Art Exhibition in Paris by his very presence', and Rivera: 'a painter whose Stalinism has caused him to degenerate.' Rivera's mural, commissioned by the Mexico's Institute of Fine Arts, Nightmare of War and Dream of Peace (Stalin and Mao confronting American and British top-hatted capitalists grouped with a baffled, female, Republican France), had been banned from the Paris exhibition by the Mexican government as potentially 'offensive to friendly nations' and 'disappeared', creating an international furore... Siqueiros himself was under no illusion as to the United States' covert role on the Cold War art scene, and energetically vilified the enemy camp: 'Our art has been completely sabotaged by the United States. This is the consequence of political events... Pictures are no longer painted of Jefferson, Lincoln or Payne; they no longer paint those who gave them the progressive laws which are now being destroyed. Now they paint cubes, spectres of men instead of men, spectres of dogs and not dogs, and they withdraw from their own problems, their own people, their own nationality to become intellectually colonial, as we in the countries which suffer their capitalist exploitation are economically and politically colonial.'<sup>liii</sup>

Curiously it was the exhibition of Mexican realism in Tokyo in September 1955, which provided the Japanese Artist's discussion group (Seisakushi Kondankai) with a non-European alternative to a realism with political and critical dimensions. The Communist critic Hayasha Fumio had initiated a polemic on realism from 1946-9; now the group condemned the dogma of European socialist realism (Fougeron's reputation had reached Japan); and of course pilloried the American imperialists, who from 1950, when the island was needed as an army base for the Korean war, launched an anti-Communist purge. Kikur Yamashita's Tale of New Japan, 1954, (bestialised with a touch of Bernard Lorjou), pilloried the alien Yankee products, slogans and Western typography. An artist such as Hiroshi Nakamura, born in 1932, who was a member of the Communist Party only from 1955 to 1959, commemorated in that year, with Revolutionary

Metropolis, the violent suppression of the popular move to rename the square in front of the imperial palace 'People's Square' on May Day, 1952.<sup>liii</sup> Nakamura's use of Japan Communist party collaged tracts on this painting is contemporaneous with the collaged fragments of Isskustvo and Les Lettres Françaises and part of a reproduction of Léger's Les Constructeurs stuck to the surface of Guttuso's famous La discussione, 1959 (Tate Gallery); strategies for 'modernising' an art of political protest in the 'free' world were multiplying.

Likewise, as part of the strategy of deStalinisation, the grand old men of a 'modernist' realism were honoured through the thaw period in the U.S.S.R.; Siqueiros addressed the Soviet Academy in October, 1955, daring to reprove what he called 'formalist academicism and mechanical realism'.<sup>liv</sup> In the wake of the twentieth Party Congress of the CPSU, its devastating revelations of Stalin's crimes, and the denunciation of the cult of personality Picasso (strongly opposed by Guerassimov) was invited to the Soviet Union.<sup>lv</sup> October, 1956 saw his 75th birthday exhibition in Moscow and Leningrad - and the Soviet invasion of Hungary.... Astonishingly, the United States Department of State organised an exhibition of American Art for Moscow in 1959, 'The Museum and its Friends: 18 living American artists' selected by the friends of the Whitney Museum.' Picasso was proposed by Ehrenbourg for the Lenin Peace Prize in 1961; here Neruda's comment to the Soviet committee was surely clinching: 'If Picasso had been against peace, if he had been among our enemies, then he would have been a menace, for he costs thousands of people.'<sup>lvi</sup> The thaw continued: Guttuso's show toured from the Hermitage to the Pushkin to Novosibirsk in 1961; Léger's posthumous exhibition (with works by Nadia Khodassievich and Georges Bauquier) was held at the Pushkin Museum in January 1963. However, Ilya Ehrenburg was officially attacked in March; Khrushchev's speech of March 8th, 1963 was the most sweeping statement on the arts since Zhdanov in 1946.<sup>lvii</sup> Despite the official end of the thaw, these exhibitions of course had an impact on the work of Soviet artists.<sup>lviii</sup>

The first critique of socialist realism from within the U.S.S.R. appeared in France in the review Esprit in February, 1959, in the wake of the furore surrounding Boris Pasternak's refusal of the Nobel prize and the publication of Dr Zhivago in the West from 1957-8. André Siniavskii described a vast, crushing, teleological and quasi-theological system of positive heroics, in parlous disarray after Stalin's death.<sup>lix</sup> The moment of a certain détournement of socialist realism from within the Eastern bloc cannot be theorised without reference to the emergence of individual talents: Werner Tübke's Zur Geschichte de deutschen Arbeiterwegung, III, 1961, deploys the triptych structure, the stacked architectures and crowd scene devices of old master German Renaissance painting to tell a contemporary story: the bitter cold, the harsh, knobbly faces of the peasants, the intractable fight for survival, he says, are those of our ancestors; a poignant timelessness becomes a trope of defence against the realities of economic stagnation in the East.<sup>lx</sup> In Western countries where 'Eurocommunism' variously flourished, strategies such as Nouvelle Figuration, Critical Realism or its Italian counterparts developed through to the early

1970s.<sup>lxi</sup> In contrast to the solemn readmission of abstract art for the P.C.F. eighteenth party congress exhibition in 1967 (anticipating the 'Exposition Lénine, 1870 - 1924' at the Grand Palais in 1970...) the ironising of socialist realism began in earnest. Satirical works by the West Berlin artist Johannes Grutzke, for example, coincided with the beginnings of the theorisation of kitsch for the 1960s generation, a decade before the first intimations of a Soviet Sots-Art in the West.<sup>lxii</sup>

The bravura and beauty of pioneer modernism gave form to the most challenging artistic propositions of this century. Political realisms, on the contrary, must function as our repository for an alternative collective memory, including works which remain the major history paintings of the late Cold War, from Jack Levine's Stalingrad (The Age of Steel), 1970, to Guttuso's Funeral of Togliatti, 1974. It is a memory of the century that comprises revolutionary heroics, tragedy, bathos and failure: Levine noted: 'Hannah Arendt's phrase "the banality of evil" applies here'. The panoplies of the great powers, the totalitarian diktats, Siniavskii's 'kilomètres de toiles' played themselves out against the backdrop of ordinary lives. And extraordinary lives: Gerhard Richter, trained to admire Guerassimov, Fougeron and Picasso, finally escaped what he called 'the criminal "idealism" of the Socialists' and was able to formulate a new vision for our times, in which realism, memory and mourning mixed inextricably with the practices of modernism: 'To believe, one must have lost God; to paint, one must have lost art.'<sup>lxiii</sup> Within the discourse of art history, the pitting of Socialist realism 'against' modernism constitutes a dialectic which, according to the former's own premises of reflection theory, incarnates the epic of the postwar period itself. It is now time to look at this epic from beyond ideology, to reevaluate the fear, the compassion and the passion invested in these debates.

#### NOTES

- i. Andrei Donatevitch Siniavskii, 'Le réalisme socialiste' Esprit, February, 1959, pp 335-6.
- ii. See Boris Groys, Staline, oeuvre d'art totale, Nîmes, Editions Jacqueline Chambon, 1989.
- iii. For Willi Munzenberg's international coordination of antifascist activity on Stalin's behalf, see Stephen Koch: Double Lives: Spies and Writers in the Secret Soviet War of Ideas Against the West, New York and Ontario, The Free Press, 1994.
- iv. See Michael O'Mahony: Representations of 'Fizkultura' in official Soviet culture from the First Five Year Plan to the Great Patriotic War, 1929-41, Ph.D. University of London, forthcoming.
- v. See Sylvie and Dominique Buisson: Léonard Tsuguhara Foujita, Paris, ACR Editions, 1987, p 203 ff, and 450-1, listing all Foujita's political paintings in the Musée National

d'Art Moderne, Tokyo.

vi. Jack Levine: Jack Levine, introduction by Milton W Brown, compiled and edited by Stephen Robert Frankel, New York, Rizzoli, 1989, p 11.

vii. See Andrew Hemingway: Philip Reisman's Etchings, Printmaking and Politics in New York, 1926-33, University College, London, 1996, and ed. Cold War Culture, London, Pluto Press, 1997, forthcoming.

viii. Christine Lindey: 'The Hidden Tradition, Western Popular Prints' in Art in the Cold War, from Vladivostok to Kalamazoo, 1945-1962, London, The Herbert Press, 1990, p 109-139; Gerard Vincent's essay on 'Communism as a way of life' in Vincent and Antoine Prost eds., in 'De la première guerre mondiale à nos jours', vol. 5 of Histoire de la vie privée, Paris, Editions du Seuil, 1987 brochures Communism's psychological dimensions.

ix. Stéphane Courtois, Marc Lazar: Histoire du Parti Communiste Français, Paris, P.U.F., 1995, p 279; Sarah Wilson, 'Debats autour du réalisme socialiste' Paris-Paris, Créations en France, 1937-1957, Centre Georges Pompidou, 1981, p 208, 211.

x. See Weggefahrten Zeitgenossen. Bildende Kunst aus drei Jahrzehnten, exhibition in honour of the 30th anniversary of the foundation of DDR, and the anniversary of the 1949 Nationalgalerie exhibition, Berlin, Altes Museum, 1979.

xi. See Karin Thomas: Die Malerie in der DDR, 1949-1979, Cologne, DuMont Buchverlag, pp 17-18 ff. In this pre-1989 text these dicta are not coordinated with Cominform directives to the S.E.D.

xii. See Martin Damus's periodisation in Malerei der DDR. Funktionen der bildenden Kunst im Realen Sozialismus, [WHERE], Taschenbuch Verlag, GmbH, 1991.

xiii. See Rosalinde Sartori: 'Stalinism and Carnival: Organisation and Aesthetics of Political Holidays' in Hans Günther ed., The Culture of the Stalin Period, London, Macmillan, 1990, pp 41-77 and the nine papers given in the session 'Socialist Realism and Aesthetic Value under Stalinism and Destalinisation' at the 22nd Annual conference of the Association of Art Historians, Newcastle, April, 1996, under the rubric 'Beauty?', chaired by Susan Reid.

xiv. See Matthew Cullerne-Bown on both men in 'Aleksandr Gerasimov', Cullerne-Bown and Brandon Taylor eds. Art of the Soviets. Painting, sculpture and architectures in a one-party state, 1917-1932, Manchester University Press, 1993, pp 121-139, and A.A. Zhdanov: Sur la littérature, la musique et l'art, Paris, Editions Sociales, 1950.

xv. See Matthew Cullerne-Bown: 'Painting in the non-Russian republics' in Cullerne-Bown and Taylor eds., Art of the Soviets, op. cit., pp 140-153. We await his definitive Socialist Realist Painting London and Newhaven, Yale University Press

(forthcoming).

xvi. For the projects for Moscow State University, and the Hotel Leningradskaia, Komosolplatz, both 1948-53 see Tyrannie des Schönen Architektur der Stalin-Seit, MAK-Osterreichisches Museum für angewandte Kunst, (Vienna), Munich, Prestel Verlag, 1994, pp 112-5. An enlargement of Shurpins' canvas was a focus of the show's hallucinatory decor.

xvii. Louis Aragon's extensive series of articles from Les Lettres Françaises nos 398-408, January 24th to April 3rd, were highly selectively reproduced, not to say censored in Jean Ristat ed.: Ecrits sur l'art moderne, Paris, Flammarion, 1981.

xviii. Aleksandr Kameski: 'Art in the twilight of totalitarianism', Art of the Soviets, op. cit., p 157 (he underlines the 'seed-corn' value of some non-orthodox art produced from 1941-5 by artists such as Robert Flak and Vera Mukhina).

xix. See Wolfgang Holz: 'Allegory and iconography in Socialist Realist painting', Art of the Soviets, op. cit., p 73, quoting Stephen Greeblatt, 'Allegory and Representation' Selected Papers from the English Institute, Baltimore and London, 1981, p. viii.

xx. A. A. Zhdanov: 'On the International Situation', in Giuliano Proccacci et al., The Cominform. Minutes of the three conferences, 1947, 1948, 1949, Fondazioni Giangiacomo Feltrinelli, Milan, 1994, in cooperation with the Russian Centre of Conservation and Study of Records for Modern History (RT sKhIDNI), p 225 (reproduced in Cahiers du communisme, November 1947, p 1150).

xxi. See Françoise Levailant: 'Note sur "l'Affaire" de la Pravda dans la presse parisienne, août-septembre 1947', in Cahiers du Musée National de l'Art Moderne, Paris-Paris number, April, 1982 p 147 ff.

xxii. See the Cominform. Minutes..., op. cit., minutes of the third conference, 16-19 November, 1949, pp 687 and 723.

xxiii. The exhibition 'L'Art et La Paix' organised by the Comité lyonnais pour la défense de la Paix' in April, 1950 involved over 300 artists. Stéphane Courtois and Marc Lazar, estimate nine or ten million French signatures to the Stockholm appeal, Histoire de P.C.F. op. cit., p 278.

xxiv. '...La dépendance du P.C.F. envers l'U.R.S.S. et le Kominform est donc totale...' Courtois and Lazar, op. cit., p 260. New Soviet archive material must thus radically qualify accounts such as Dominique Berthet: Le P.C.F., le Culture et l'art, Paris, Editions La Table Ronde, 1990.

xxv. Annie Kriegel: Le système communiste mondial, Paris, PUF, 1984, p 144.

xxvi. See for example eds. Christopher Duggan and Christopher Wagstaff: Italy in the Cold War. Politics, Culture and Society, 1948-58, Oxford and Washington, Berg, 1995.

xxvii. Laurent Casanova Le Communisme, la Pensée et l'Art, Editions du Parti Communiste Français, 1947.

xxviii. Extracts from Plekhanov's L'Art et la Vie Sociale appeared first in Littérature de la Révolution Mondiale now 3 and 4, 1931 and l'Humanité, January 1932. See also for example, André Fougeron: 'David et nous' Arts de France no 31, 1950; Louis Aragon L'Exemple de Courbet, 1952 and Hélène Parmelin: Le massacre des Innocents, 1954, published, like Paul Eluard's highly ideological Anthologie des Ecrits du l'Art, (3 vols, 1952-4) by the Editions Cercle d'Art (possibly subsidised by Picasso)

xxix. See Jean-Marie Goulemot: 'Candide militant', Libre no 7, 1980.

xxx. See Sarah Wilson: Art and the Politics of the Left in France, c 1935-1955, Ph.D. University of London, 1992, Chapter 5: 'Martyrs and Militants', pp 281 ff and Chapter 6, pp 352-3.

xxxi. See Roger Garaudy: 'Artistes sans uniforme', Arts de France, no 9.

xxxii. Sources range from the Washington Post, or, crucially, the Communist Daily Worker to the panoply of North American immigrant journals such as A Teny, a Hungarian-language monthly published in Los Angeles. Beyond these national boundaries the FBI received reports on Picasso's activities from Latin America - El Nacional, Venezuela, the Dairo Popular, Montevideo, and from Cuba.

xxxiii. The C.I.A. funding story, first exposed by Max Kosloff and Eva Cockroft in the 1970s is itself subject to expansion and critical revision: see Andrew Hemingway ed. Cold War Culture op. cit., and particularly Stacy Tenebaum: A dialectical pretzel. The New American Painting. The Museum of Modern Art and Cultural Diplomacy, 1953-1959: Revisionism revised, M.A. report, Courtauld Institute of Art, 1992.

xxxiv. Picasso w Polsce, Wydawnictwo Literackie, Krakow, various authors, undated, and Dominique Desanti: Nous avons choisi la Paix Editions Pierre Seghers, 1949.

xxxv. Jean-François Laglenne: 'L'Art au Congrès de la Paix', Arts de France, no 34, January 1951.

xxxvi. See Louis Aragon: L'Art et le Sentiment National. Le Scandale du Salon d'Automne, Editions Les Lettres Françaises et tous les Arts, 1951 and Daniel Abadie, Bernard Ceysson, Jean-Luc Daval, Gérard Singer, Geneva, Editions d'Art Albert Skira, 1995.

xxxvii. Ryszard Stanislawski's: 'Réalisme Socialiste et avant-garde' Les Années 50, Editions du Centre Pompidou, 1988, illustrates Fangor's more modernistic Postaci, 1950. A General Exhibition of Soviet painting moved from Berlin to Warsaw in 1951; Katarzyna Muthesis-Murawska illustrated the change in Lodz Museum policy (AAH conference, Newcastle, 1995); see also Oblicza socrealizmu, Warsaw, Muzeum

Norodwe w Warszawie, Gabinet Grafiki, 1987.

xxxviii. For Neruda's speech (November 22nd, 1950) see Arts de France, no 33, December, 1950.

xxxix. Mao's speech is reproduced in French (with many other precious documents) in Eric Janicot: La Pensée Plastique de Zao Wou-Ki et les naissances de l'art moderne chinois, 3ème cycle, Paris 1, Panthéon-Sorbinne, 1984.

xl. See Arnold Chang: Painting and Politics in the People's Republic of China. The politics of style, Boulder, Colorado, Westview Press, 1980; Joan Lebold Cohen: The New Chinese Painting, 1949-1986, New York, Harry N. Abrams Inc., 1987 and Julia F. Andrews: Painters and Politics in the People's Republic of China, 1949-1979, University of California Press, 1994.

xli. Bancel: Ho Chih Minh and Andrée Fontainas: Ho Chih Minh au congrès de Tours were shown at De Marx à Staline, Maison de Metallurgie, Paris, May 14th-31st, 1953.

xlii. For the little-known realist context of Guttuso's early work see Italienische Realisten, 1945 bis 1974, Neue Gesellschaft für Bildende Kunst und Kunstamt, Kreuzberg, Berlin, 1974.

xliii. See De Micheli et al.: Guttuso, Milan, Fratelli Fabbri Editore, 1976, quoting Guttuso's Contadine de Scicilia, and L'Occupatione delle terre, Milan, 1970.

xliv. See Frances K. Pohl: 'An American in Venice: Ben Shahn and American Foreign Policy at the 1954 Venice Biennale', Art History no 4, March, 1981, pp 80-113.

xlv. See James Hyman: 'A "Pioneer Painter", Renato Guttuso and Realism in Britian', Renato Guttuso, Whitechapel Art Gallery, London, Thames and Hudson, 1996, pp 39-53.

xlvi. See Lynda Morris and Robert Radford eds., AIA, the Story of the Artists' International Association, 1933-1953, Museum of Modern Art, Oxford, 1983, and The Forgotten Fifties, Sheffield City Art Galleries, 1984.

xlvii. My text 'Femmes d'Algérie, Femmes Françaises, autour de Mireille Mialhe', an essential complement to Christian Derouet's discussion of Taslitzky's drawings and the only witness to women's struggle and torture in the whole exhibition - was omitted, at the artist's insistence from La Guerre d'Algérie, Paris, Musée d'Histoire Contemporaine, 199CH.

xlviii. See Gérard Gosselin ed., Picasso, 145 dessins pour la presse et les organisations démocratiques, La Courneuve, Editions de l'Humanité, 1973.

xlix. Pablo Neruda, as note 38.

i. See Philippe Régnier: La propagande anticommuniste de Paix et Liberté, France, 1950-1956, Université Libre de Bruxelles, 1986, and for 'Paix et Liberté' posters, Laurent Gervereau and Philippe Buton eds., Le Couteau entre les Dents, Paris, Editions du Chêne, 1989. 'Paix et Liberté' in Italy etc implies a European-wide strategy.

li. Hence the 'vâcherie' of Magritte's 1948 La liberté de l'esprit, which he thought to use in April 1950 as an illustration to 'Mise au point adressée confidentiellement aux intellectuels communistes'... See also for the Belgian response Christian Dotremont's: La Réalisme Socialiste contre la Révolution, Editions Cobra, 1950. Breton's 'Pourquoi nous cache-t-on la peinture russe contemporaine?' and 'Du Réalisme socialiste considéré comme moyen d'extermination morale' appeared in Arts, on January 11th, and May 1st, 1952.

lii. David A. Siqueiros: 'The Salutary Presence of Mexican Art in Paris' (Comments on an article by Philippe Soupault, lecture given at the Palace of Fine Arts, Mexico City, August 26th, 1954), in Art and Revolution, London, Lawrence and Wishart, 1975, pp 148, 163.

[VERSION FRANCAIS A TROUVER]

liii. See Kaido Kazu: 'Reconstruction: the Role of the avant-garde in postwar Japan' Reconstructions. Avant-Garde Art in Japan, 1945-1965, Oxford, Museum of Modern Art, 1985, and Haryu Ichiro: 'Réalisme et mouvements politiques', Le Japon des Avant-gardes, Editions du Centre Pompidou, 1986, pp 238 ff.

liv. Siqueiros: 'Open letter to the Painters, Sculptors and Engravers of the Soviet Union' in Art and Revolution, op. cit., p.178.

lv. A secret memo to the Culture department of the CPSU dated February 21st, 1957, 'About the State of Soviet Fine Arts' while denouncing the monopoly of State commissions, nonetheless declared the impossibility of refuting the methods of socialist realism.

lvi. Supplication by Ehrenburg to the CPSU Central Committee was nonetheless necessary to prevent the pulping of the first monograph on Picasso by Ivor Golomstock and André Siniavsky with Ehrenbourg's own introduction.

lvii. See Priscilla Johnson: Khrushchev and the Arts. The Politics of Soviet Culture, 1962-1964, Cambridge, Massachussetts, the M.I.T. Press, 1965, with selected documents.

lviii. See Susan E. Reid: Destalinisation and the Remodernisation of Soviet Art. The Search for a Contemporary Realism, Ph.D., University of Northumbria at Newcastle, 1995. CH.

lix. Andrei Siniavskii's 'Le réalisme socialiste' (taken to France in 1956), appeared anonymously in Esprit, February 1959, pp 535-366, and as On Socialist Realism by 'Abram Tertz,' New York, Pantheon Books, 1960. He was condemned to seven years'

hard labour in 1966; see Max Hayward: On Trial, New York, Harpers and Row, 1966.

lx. See Eduard Beaucamp: 'Der Maler Werner Tübke' in Eckhart Gillen and Rainer Haarmann eds., Kunst in der DDR. Künstler, Galerien, Museen, Kulturpolitik, Overath, Kiepenheuer & Witsch, 1990, pp 376-8.

lxi. See Agnes van der Plaetsen: La Politique culturelle et artistique du PCI. Les Arts Plastiques 1956-1973, Doctorat de l'Institut Universitaire Européen, Florence, 1992.

lxii. See Ludwig Giesz: Phänomenologie des Kitsches, (1960), Munich, Wilhelm Fink Verlag, 1971 (preceding Gillo Dorfless Kitsch, Milan, Gabriele Mazotta, editore, 1968). Komar and Melamid's article of c 1978 'Sots-Art', published in Zinovy Zinik, appeared in Syntaxis, Paris, no 3, 1979. CH

lxiii. Gerhard Richter: 'Notes, 1962', The Daily Practice of Painting, (Gerhard Richter, Texte, 1993), London, Thames and Hudson, 1995, pp 13, 15.